

VICTORIAN VILLAGE COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES

Thursday April 9, 2015

6:00 p.m.

50 W. Gay Street, Ground Floor - Conference Room B

Commissioners Present: Aaron Borchers, Marc Conte, Jack Decker, Jeffery Hissem (6:15pm), Lisl Kotheimer.

Commissioners Absent: Shawn Conyers.

HPO Staff Present: James Goodman.

- I.** CALL TO ORDER – 6:04pm.
- II.** NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 pm (Noon), Thursday, May 7, 2015 – 50 W. Gay Street, Ground Floor - Conference Room A.
- III.** NEXT COMMISSION HEARING –Thursday, May 14, 2015.
- IV.** SWEAR IN STAFF
- V.** APPROVAL OF MINUTES – Thursday, March 12, 2015. MOTION: Decker/Borchers (4-0-0) APPROVED.
- VI.** PUBLIC FORUM
- VII.** STAFF APPROVALS
- VIII.** APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

STAFF RECOMMENDED APPLICATIONS

1. 15-4-11

1149 Neil Ave.

Lisa Craig Morton & Geoffrey E. Morton (Owners)

Approve application #15-4-11, 1149 Neil Ave., as submitted with the following clarifications:

Staff Recommended Application

- Remove deteriorated wood v-groove siding on south elevation of carriage house.
- Install new hardi-plank lap siding with a 2.5” exposure.
- Revise trim on south elevation as needed to match existing; all new trim to be cedar.
- The applicant has the option to replace all elevations of the siding with 2.5” exposure hardi-plank lap siding.

MOTION: Decker/Kotheimer (4-0-0) APPROVED.

2. 15-4-12

1017-1019 Neil Ave.

Urbanorder Architecture (Applicant)

Michael Duffy (Owner)

Approve application #15-4-12, 1017-1019 Neil Ave., as submitted:

Staff Recommended Application

- Remove existing deteriorated concrete porch stoops.
- Install new porch stoop per submitted drawings.
- Stoop to be a concrete slab, with split-face block foundation, and metal railing (Fortin R5).

MOTION: Decker/Hissem (5-0-0) APPROVED.

3. 15-4-13

1015 N. High St.

DaNite Sign Co. (Applicant)

Lenhart-Frauenberg Partnership (Owner)

Approve application #15-4-13, 1015 N. High St., as submitted:

Staff Recommended Application

- Remove existing wall sign.
- Install new externally-illuminated wall sign per submitted renderings.

MOTION: Decker/Kotheimer (5-0-0) APPROVED.

4. 15-4-14

208-212 Wilber Ave.

David M. O'Reilly (Owner)

Recommend approval of variance application #15-4-14, 208-212 Wilber Ave., as submitted:

Staff Recommended Application

Variance Recommendation Request

- CC3333.15 - to allow a second separate dwelling on a parcel
- CC3333.16 - to eliminate the requirement, with respect to the proposed carriage house, that each dwelling on the property shall front on a public street.
- CC3333.26 - to reduce the required minimum side yard from 5 feet to 3 feet 6 inches on each side.
- CC3332.03 - one single family dwelling. Allow second dwelling in form of a carriage house.
- CC3312.49C - two spaces per dwelling. Allow for 3 spaces off street in the garage.
- CC3333.15 - Allow building to cover more than 50% of lot area. The lot coverage will be 2497 square feet off coverage on 4980 square feet of land to 7 square feet more than 50%.

MOTION: Decker/Hissem (4-0-1) RECOMMEND APPROVAL. [Borchers Abstained]

CONTINUED APPLICATIONS

5. 15-3-7

765 N. High St. (Suite A)

Jesse Johnson (Applicant)

CMH Midtown Properties, LLC (Owner)

Approve application #15-3-7, 765 N. High St. (Suite A), as submitted:

- Install new 48"x 48" non-illuminated blade sign; with two (2) gooseneck fixtures per submitted drawings.

MOTION: Decker/Kotheimer (5-0-0) APPROVED.

NEW APPLICATIONS

6. 15-4-15

72 W. Third Ave.

New Avenue Architects (Applicant)

EAC Properties, LLC (Owner)

Approve application #15-4-15, 72 W. Third Ave., as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Remove existing wood windows.
- Install four (4) new windows on rear elevation in former window locations.
- All new windows to be Pella Architectural Series aluminum clad windows.
- Aluminum-clad windows are appropriate for a building of this era (1962).

MOTION: Decker/Borchers (5-0-0) APPROVED.

7. 15-4-16

1243 Neil Ave.

Paul D. Hixon & Robert Dean (Owners)

Approve application #15-4-16, 1243 Neil Ave., as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Remove second door on front elevation, restore the opening to its original window size/configuration, and install new wood window.
- Remove shuttered panel located at the porch of the west elevation, enlarge opening to original size and install new wood window.
- Remove two (2) existing windows on west elevation, reduce opening size by approximately 24", and install two (2) new wood windows.
- The infill brick is to be historic brick from the house. All details are to match existing.

MOTION: Hissem/Kotheimer (3-2-0) APPROVED. [Decker, Conte]

8. 15-4-17

41 W. Third Ave.

Amanda & Robert Bundy (Owners)

After presentation by the Applicant and discussion by the Victorian Village Commission, Application #15-4-17 was divided into items 'a' and 'b' for clarity of review and the following motions were made, votes taken, and results recorded:

Approve application #15-4-17a, 41 W. Third Ave., as submitted with the following clarifications:

Exterior Alterations

- Covert existing carriage house into two (2) living units.
- Alteration of carriage house with the addition of a third garage door.
- New garage doors are to be without windows. Final door selection to be submitted to HPO Staff for final review and approval.

MOTION: Decker/Hissem (5-0-0) APPROVED.

Recommend variance application #15-4-17b, 41 W. Third Ave., as submitted:

Variance Recommendation Request

- CC3312.49 - to reduce the number of required parking spaces from 6 to 3 with an additional 2 spaces on lease from neighbor.
- CC3333.01 - to permit two dwellings (three units total) on one lot.
- CC3333.15 - to permit the existing house and carriage house combined to exceed the maximum lot coverage (53.46%).
- CC3333.16 - to allow the carriage house to front the alley.
- CC3333.22 - to allow existing maximum side yard of carriage dwelling to be approximately 1.9 feet.
- CC3333.23 - to permit 3.8 feet of side yard on the west side of the house, 1.8 feet on the west side of the carriage house, and 0.9 feet on the east side of the carriage house.
- CC3333.24 - to allow no rear yard for the carriage house.

MOTION: Decker/Kotheimer (5-0-0) RECOMMEND APPROVAL.

9. 15-4-18

130-132 Starr Ave.

Sullivan Bruck Architects, LLC (Applicant)

Snyder Barker, LLC (Owner)

After presentation by the Applicant and discussion by the Victorian Village Commission, Application #15-4-18 was divided into items 'a' and 'b' for clarity of review and the following motions were made, votes taken, and results recorded:

Approve application #14-4-18a, 130-132 Starr Ave., as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Construction of ten (10) new townhomes in four (4) separate buildings; two (2) doubles and two (2) triples.
- Townhomes to be two-bedroom, 2 ½ bath with lower level den and attached two-car garage opening on private drive behind the buildings. (Private drive shared with Aston Row Townhouses to the north).
- The light fixtures on the garages are to be gooseneck fixtures.

MOTION: Decker/Kotheimer (5-0-0) APPROVED.

Approve application #14-4-18b, 130-132 Starr Ave., as submitted:

- The applicant has the option to omit the chimneys from the building design.

MOTION: Decker/Borchers (4-1-0) APPROVED. [Decker]

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW APPLICATIONS

10. 15-4-19

955-987 N. High St.

Connie J. Klema, Attorney (Applicant)

White Castle System, Inc (Owner)

Conceptual Review

- Redevelopment of the existing White Castle site, including: a public/private parking structure, commercial & retail uses, and residential apartments.

NO ACTION TAKEN

Following the presentation by the applicant, Chair Conte called all those wishing to speak in order of speaker slips received.

<u>Name, Address, Affiliation:</u>	<u>Issues/ Comments:</u>
Larry Totzke 19 E. Third Ave.	Supports the construction of an additional parking garage within the neighborhood.
Joe Valenti 989 N. High St.	Is in support of the project and is excited about the development and increasing available public parking.

Commissioner Comments

- **Commissioner Borchers** – is in support of a mixed-use project and appreciates the City of Columbus’ involvement in creating new parking opportunities within the neighborhood. Understands the need to maximize the footprint on projects within the Short North, but maximizing the airspace can be too much for the neighborhood. The location is a large site, and the project will need work. The “one building” look will need to be broken up visually, and setbacks will be important on the upper floors.
- **Commissioner Decker** – Understands the need for parking within the neighborhood. The neighborhood needs more office space and encourages the applicant to include additional office rather than living units. White Castle is known as a strong neighborhood supporter. The design for the site will need to be a contributing element for the district. The context of the site will be important, and the design will be to be visually broken up to help conceal the overall size and mass of the building. Knows that the development will need to be larger to accomplish the goals of the project.
- **Commissioner Conte** – Agrees with the comments of the other Commissioners. The design will need to work within the guidelines and standards for development within a historic district. The height, form, and massing will need work to address the apparent mass/size of the building. Setbacks may be helpful in the design process to address the apparent mass; the Jackson and the Dakota buildings are examples of successful setbacks. The architectural design should break up the building visually.
- **Commissioner Kotheimer** – Converting some of the space of the building to additional office space would be helpful for parking within the area. The details of the design will be important; as the height of buildings increase there is a tendency to use lesser materials, it will be important to use quality materials and design details.
- **Commissioner Hissem** – The massing of the building needs to be addressed and broken down. White Castle in the neighborhood is iconic and needs to remain that way. This project really needs to push the design and become a truly iconic building within the district and the City of Columbus. The existing White Castle sign needs to be maintained and integrated into the development. There is a great opportunity with this site and this project.

STAFF APPROVED APPLICATIONS

- **15-4-1**

15-29 West Poplar Street

Michael Paplow (Applicant) Giannopoulos Properties (Owner)

Approve Application #15-4-1, 15-29 West Poplar Avenue, for the exact same work as previously reviewed and approved per C. of A. #12-12-14 and C. of A. #13-8-15 with all clarifications as noted:

- Construct new 3-story building on vacant lot; with two (2) levels of residential units over ground floor commercial.
- Building to have brick façades on west, east, and north elevations. South elevation to have metal panels above brick.
- North elevation to have aluminum storefront system on ground floor and aluminum clad 1-over-1 windows above.
- Additional details include: limestone sills, lintels, and coping.
- No openings are to be located on the east of west façades.
- The wall/panel signs are to be removed from the signage package; the projecting signs are approved.
- South façade to have brick with balconies and metal panels at bays.
- Final drawings are to be submitted to HPO Staff for final review and approval prior to issuance of certificate of appropriateness.

- **15-4-2**

310 Tappan St.

Chelsea Campbell (Owner)

Approve Application #15-4-2, 310 Tappan St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Repair/replace broken and/or missing roof slate as needed to match existing.
- Repair damaged eaves as needed to match existing.
- Repair/replace gutters as needed to match existing.
- Remove existing rain barrels with new downspouts and paint to match existing.

Repair Slate Roof

- Replace any/all missing, damaged, and deteriorated slate on the main roof with new or used slate of the exact same color and profile and in accordance with all applicable City Code and industry standards.

Eave, Soffit & Fascia Repair

- Repair and or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood eave soffit and fascia on all elevations as necessary with new wood of exact same profile and dimension; like-for-like.

Repair/Replace Gutters & Downspouts

- Examine all existing, metal, ogee (k-style) gutters on the house and make any repairs and/or replace the existing gutter system on all elevations with new metal, ogee (k-style) gutters.
- Install new, corrugated metal downspouts in the appropriate locations to assure proper drainage.
- Examine the existing storm water drainage system for soundness and proper function. Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

- **15-4-3**

892-894 Dennison Ave.

Lisker Holdings, LLC (Owner)

Approve Application #15-4-3, 892-894 Dennison Ave., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Repair/replace any/all deteriorated wood trim elements as needed to match existing.
- Repair/replace deteriorated eaves, soffit, and fascia as needed to match existing.
- All work to be painted Valspar “White”, Valspar “High Speed Steel”, and Valspar “Vintage Grey”.

Eave, Soffit & Fascia Repair

- Repair and or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood eave soffit and fascia on all elevations as necessary with new wood of exact same profile and dimension; like-for-like.

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications, and per submitted paint color chips.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

- **15-4-4**

940 Neil Ave.

Leonora Fix (Owner)

Approve Application #15-4-4, 940 Neil Ave., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Renew COA#14-5-16, 940 Neil Ave., exactly as previously approved for a period of one (1) year. Expired: 5-14-15.

- **15-4-5**

1017-1019 Neil Ave.

Michael J. Duffy (Owner)

Approve Application #15-4-5, 1017-1019 Neil Ave., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Renew COA#09-6-20, 1017-1019 Neil Ave., exactly as previously approved for a period of one (1) year. Expired: 5-29-10.

- **15-4-6**

1149 Neil Ave.

Lisa Craig Morton & Geoffrey E. Morton (Owners)

Approve Application #15-4-6, 1149 Neil Ave., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Repair box gutters on main house as needed to match existing and per submitted specifications.
- Install new 4" downspouts per submitted specifications.
- Repair/replace deteriorated trim, crown, and fascia as needed to match existing.
- All work to be painted to match existing color scheme.

Repair Box Gutters

- Examine all box gutters and make any repairs and/or replace the existing box gutter system on all elevations with new materials of appropriate dimension and profile.
- Reline with new copper, terne metal, galvanized metal, or E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with industry standards, manufacturer's specifications, and Columbus Building Codes.
- Install new, round, galvanized metal downspouts in the appropriate locations to assure proper drainage.
- Examine the existing storm water drainage system for soundness and proper function. Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

Eave, Soffit & Fascia Repair

- Repair and or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood eave soffit and fascia on all elevations as necessary with new wood of exact same profile and dimension; like-for-like.

Exterior Painting

- Paint to match existing color scheme. Any new colors are to be submitted with paint color chips to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.
- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint color chips for finish coat are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of the paint.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**

- **15-4-7**

1199 Highland St.

Muth & Company Roofing (Applicant) Patrick Colo (Owner)

Approve Application #15-4-7, 1199 Highland St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Remove existing asphalt shingle roof.
- Install new GAF "Slateline" dimensional asphalt shingle roof; color to be "English Gray Slate".
- Install new metal ridge roll, valleys, and flashing; color to be "Tinner's Red".

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles.
- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "Tinner's Red" or "Gray."
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "Tinner's Red" or "Gray."
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

- **15-4-8**

315-317 W. Hubbard Ave.

Dale Deubler (Owner)

Approve Application #15-4-8, 315-317 W. Hubbard Ave., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Remove ornamental grass borders in rear yard and gravel parking area.
- Install new 6' wood privacy fence in rear yard to separate parking area from grass area and to divide the rear yard between units per submitted siteplan.

Install New Privacy Fence

- Install new 6' wood privacy fence along per submitted design and siteplan. Fence to be painted or stained within one (1) year. Stain/paint color for all fence to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

- **15-4-9**

28 W. Poplar St.

Carol Meyer/Pella Windows (Applicant) Eric McDonough (Owner)

Approve Application #15-4-9, 28 W. Poplar St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Remove existing aluminum windows from four (4) window openings (*12 units total*).
- Install new Pella “Designer III” series aluminum-clad windows in existing openings to match existing profiles per submitted specifications.
- Exterior color to be “Hartford Green”.
- Replace entrance doors per submitted specifications.

- **15-4-10**

840 Dennison Ave.

Ohio Exteriors, LLC (Applicant) Kevin Ballard (Owner)

Approve Application #15-4-10, 840 Dennison Ave., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Remove existing asphalt shingle roof.
- Install new Owens Corning standard 3tab asphalt shingle roof; color to be “Estate Gray”.
- Install new metal ridge roll, valleys, and flashing; color to be “Gray”.

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer’s specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a “W” channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles.
- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted “Tinner’s Red” or “Gray.”
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted “Tinner’s Red” or “Gray.”
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

The Victorian Village Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved items into the formal record. Votes are as indicated, with abstentions (if any) shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.

MOTION: Decker/Kotheimer (4-0-0) APPROVED.

VIII. OLD BUSINESS

IX. NEW BUSINESS

X. ADJOURNMENT –Borchers/ Kotheimer (5-0-0) ADJOURNED. 7:53 pm.